## **NOVA SCOTIA COURT OF APPEAL**

**Citation:** Smith v. Michelin North America (Canada) Inc., 2008 NSCA 107

Date: 20081120 Docket: CA 290297 Registry: Halifax

**Between:** 

**Everett Smith** 

Appellant

- and -

Michelin North America (Canada) Inc.

Respondent

**Judge:** The Honourable Justice Fichaud

**Appeal Heard:** October 6 and 7, 2008

**Subject:** Pensions - contribution holidays - costs - reimbursement of costs

by trust fund

**Summary:** Employer took contribution holidays during periods of actuarial

surplus under a defined benefit pension plan. Members brought representative action for an order that the employer reimburse the trust fund for the value of the contribution holidays. Supreme

Court of Nova Scotia dismissed the claim and ordered costs against

the representative plaintiff.

**Issue:** Did the judge err by dismissing the claim? Did she err by not

awarding costs from the trust fund to the unsuccessful plaintiff?

**Result:** The Court of Appeal dismissed the appeal. The pension plan's

contribution clause did not contain a defined contribution formula,

and retained actuarial practice that a contribution holiday is

appropriate from surplus in a defined benefit plan. The claim was adversarial and the judge was entitled to award costs against the

unsuccessful party.

This information sheet does not form part of the court's judgment. Quotes must be from the judgment, not this cover sheet. The full court judgment consists of 32 pages.